



Improving REsearch capacities of Albanian higher education institutions in conservation and restoration of Cultural Heritage

Comparative report and analysis of EU standards for research training in cultural heritage conservation

[project outcome 5.1]



Co-funded by the
Erasmus+ Programme
of the European Union



Table of contents

Introduction	3
Professional recognition, education and qualification of conservator-restorers	5
Assessment of the current scenario in Albania	5
Assessment of the current scenario in Italy	8
Assessment of the current scenario in Spain.....	16
Professional recognition, education and qualification of conservator-restorers: summary on current key issues at EU level	21
Concluding remarks and considerations on future perspectives	26

This document has been drafted within REACH project [Improving REsearch capacities of Albanian higher education institutions in conservation and restoration of Cultural Heritage], co-funded under the Erasmus Plus Program of the European Union (Project Reference 610390-EPP-1- 2019-1-AL-EPPKA2-CBHE-SP). Any form of reproduction and sharing, even partial, of the document and its contents is subject to the authorization of those who have contributed to its drafting.

This document has been written by DR. Sara Fiorentino, University of Bologna (sara.fiorentino2@unibo.it) who has designed the report, collected and discussed all data provided by the Albanian, Italian and Spanish Institutions participating in the project.

Introduction

Within the project, Work Package n.5 (WP5) aims to reach a structural impact on the Albanian High Education Institution system (HEIs) concerning research training in cultural heritage, with specific attention to conservation and restoration practices.

The main goal of WP5 is, thus, to assess and define a framework of governmental priorities able to provide a background for structural applied research to cultural heritage conservation and restoration within HEIs. The current need for a more rigorous definition of well-trained and updated professional figures to be employed as researchers in cultural heritage conservation and restoration field of study, has clearly been highlighted in the recently approved LIGJ Nr. 27/2018 "Per Trashegimine Kulturore dhe Muzete"

(<http://planifikimi.gov.al/index.php?eID=dumpFile&t=f&f=4013&token=226df4ac6d637e59f1afbfd0d458ee99ea3d5c3c>), also representing the best warranty for urging governmental institutions to put the highest interest in REACH project and in this specific WP.

In agreement with all project partners, the implementation of WP5 will be mainly focused on the conservator-restorer and the requisites that this figure needs to possess in terms of specific training, research skills and professional qualification. This choice stems from the awareness that a tangible improvement of research capacities of Albanian higher education institutions in conservation and restoration of cultural heritage (primary objective of REACH) demands a realistic scenario to be outlined and, therefore, an in-depth knowledge of Albanian partners needs and requirements to be met. Only a sound awareness of the critical issues currently pursuant to the specific training of figures capable of operating on cultural heritage can direct toward the inception of a capacity building process that can be suitable to a concrete transfer of skills, designed on both the criticalities and the strengths of the Albanian situation.

From this starting premise, WP5 is expected to run for the entire duration of the project (Jan20-Dec22), proceeding parallel to the preparation phase (WP1) and all the development actions (WPs2 to 4).

Need analysis process carried out in the frame of WP1 has been aimed at defining research priorities and key issues related to cultural heritage conservation and applied research to this field in Albania. Although with a delay compared to the original schedule, due to the spread of COVID-19 health emergency and to the entry into force of epidemiological containment measures (which have

imposed restrictions on international mobility and limitations to work in presence)¹, some preliminary data have been collected during Action 1.2, consisting of an analysis over cultural heritage legislation and management in Albania to outline the current scenario on ministerial regulations defining criteria for the assignment of restoration works and adopted conservation practices.

For the assessment to proceed despite COVID-19 restrictions, a questionnaire has been prepared and administered to the representatives of the Albanian MOESY (Ministry of Education, Sports and Youth) involved in REACH project, with a list of questions for the collection of necessary data for defining the aforementioned state of the art. Provided information, presented and discussed in this document, have represented the starting point for implementing WP5 in order to begin Action 1.5 and reach WP5 first outcome, ref.nr. 5.1 (*Report: an analysis of the EU standards for research training in cultural heritage*). More specifically, data related to Albanian situation have been compared with the current scenarios in the EU project partners (Italy and Spain) and with reference to European professional standards (i.e. European Network of Conservation-Restoration Education - ENCoRE www.encore-edu.org - and European Confederation of Conservator-Restorers' Organisations - E.C.C.O. www.ecco-eu.org/).

This document provides a report on what has been carried out so far since the beginning of project activities to start, implement and reach the first outcome of WP5. In the following pages, obtained data from the need analysis carried out in Albania, Italy and Spain will first be shown, compared, and discussed. A perspective summary on what has been done so far at EU level for definition, training, and qualification of conservators-restores as professional figures will be provided, to put acquired data into a broader context that would work as a premise for the development of further actions within WP5.

¹ More details can be found in the document named *First summary of completed activities and tasks within the Project*, discussed among Steering Committee members on 11th December 2020.

Professional recognition, education and qualification of conservator-restorers

Assessment of the current scenario in Albania²

Are there national laws establishing the requirements that restorers must have in Albania?

According to Law Nr. 27/2018 PËR TRASHËGIMINË KULTURORE DHE MUZETË (FOR THE CULTURAL HERITAGE AND THE MUSEUMS)³, the restorer as a professional figure has not a clearly defined profile; their formation and update is carried out under the Regional Centre for Conservation and Restoration, which deals with licensed persons too. Centers for the restoration of cultural heritages are established inside Institutions dealing with cultural heritage, such as National Film Archive, National Library, Medieval Art National Museum, National Museum of Fine Arts, National Museum of Photography "Marubi", where future restorers are formed, according to the law's provisions.

Which professional skills and/or qualifications are required to restorers under current legislation?

By the Albanian legislation, the National Committee for the Material Cultural Heritage is the national authority establishing the requirements that restorers must have and is issuing the licenses for the Restorers according to their specific criteria's.

The decision of the Council of Ministers no. 792, of 07.10.2020 "*On the determination of special conditions and criteria licensing, accompanying documents, subcategories of licenses, procedures for granting, suspension or revocation, as well as annual license quotation for interventions in cultural materials*" determines the categories and subcategories of licenses, subjects that can apply for such licenses and the criteria for obtaining a license.

Which type(s) of qualification(s) allow a restorer to work in Albania today (i.e., inscription in the register of restorers / minimum number of years of work activity certified)?

Professional skills and/or qualifications required to conservators-restorers under current legislation can vary, depending upon the category for which the applicant is presenting his/her request (i.e.

² This section of the document has been drafted based on collected data from need analysis, carried out by Ingrit Jushi and Jetlir Gjergji, Albanian Ministry of Education, Sports and Youth.

³ Full text:

<http://planifikimi.gov.al/index.php?eID=dumpFile&t=f&f=4013&token=226df4ac6d637e59f1afbfd0d458ee99ea3d5c3c>

restorers of architectural pieces, or restorers of art works etc). However, regardless of the category, the four main requirements consist in:

- a) A certain number of years of work experience in the profession cited in the diploma;
- b) Work experience in specialised institutions working on cultural heritage;
- c) Professional specialisations regarding the subcategory (held, certified or recognised by the Ministry of Culture);
- d) Authorship or co-authority in conservation project design - restoration according to the subcategory of approved according to the legislation on cultural heritage.

Are there certification bodies for Albanian restores?

The Ministry of Culture, through the institutions under its authority, is the certification body for Albanian restorers operating in the field of cultural heritage.

Which qualification(s) do people who currently work as restorers in Albania have (i.e., diploma, bachelor/master degree, etc.) Are there any academic courses in Albania that train restores? In which institutions/universities is it possible to find these training courses?

Regarding the qualifications that restores must possess, according to decision of the Council of Ministers no. 792, of 07.10.2020 a Master of Science in Architecture, Archeology, Constructing Engineering and /or plus 1- year Professional Master in “Conservation and Restoration” is requested. The Faculty of Architecture and Urbanism / Polytechnic University Tirana is currently the unique institution providing this 1-year Professional Master Degree in Restoration.

Please provide detailed information on the adopted training methodology within these courses: what the minimum qualification for accessing the courses is? What are the available educational curricula? What kind of subjects are taught (i.e. scientific subjects/humanities)? Are there training activities on the field? How many hours of practical activities are delivered to students?

Candidate students wishing to pursue a Professional Master Degree in Restoration must have as minimum 3 years of studies in the Integrated Diploma of Architecture and Urbanism, or must have the Bachelor Degree in Civil Engineering.

The disciplines, divided into 2 semesters, for a total of n.60 ECTS, are:

- History and method of architectural analysis;
- Methodologies of detection and presentation of cultural monuments;
- Restoration: conservation and evaluation; Consolidation of historical buildings;
- Restoration of urban centers and historical landscape;
- Restoration of the materials and decorative surfaces of the architecture;
- Recovering and revitalization of the monuments;
- Cataloguing and museography; Economical bases and the management of the cultural heritage;
- Practice on site (5 hours - the program of the practice on the site is developed in closed cooperation with institutions operating in the field of cultural heritage);
- Atelier Diploma.

Can students from these courses immediately work as a professional restorer or do they have to pass an abilitation exam?

As the conservator-restorer is not a regulated profession yet, there currently is no state exam needed. However, for restoration work the graduated students need to have a license provided by the National Committee of the Material Cultural Heritage. Criteria's have not been published yet.

Assessment of the current scenario in Italy⁴

Taking the Albanian scenario into account, it is important to outline an overview on the professional figures working in the field of cultural heritage (with specific attention to conservation-restoration) in Italy and Spain, to set the basis for a constructive comparison.

The **conservator of cultural heritage** carries out coordination activities related to documentation, safeguard, management and enhancement of cultural heritage (archaeological and historic-artistic manufacts). He/she is in charge to design a general path of action for preservation and enhancement of cultural heritage, coordinating other professional figures involved in the process and supporting them in the organization and implementation of all phases. The university training path is divided into a 3 + 2 program: three-year bachelor and two-year master degree. At the end of both the three-year and two-year courses, a degree thesis must be taken. Enrolment in the master course is not mandatory: the choice is subject to the individual's interest in continuing their studies and deepening their training.

The **conservation scientist** is a technical-scientific figure with knowledge on chemistry, physics, biology, geology and informatics applied to cultural heritage and further knowledge in conservation (ethics, history, cultural values, historical technologies, past and present conservation technologies and practice, specific scientific aspects, etc.). His/her training enables him/her to contribute to the study and conservation of cultural heritage within an interdisciplinary team. The university training path is divided into a 3+2 program: a three-year bachelor degree in applied technologies for conservation and restoration of cultural heritage and a two-year degree course in science for the conservation-restoration of cultural heritage. At the end of both the three-year and two-year periods, a degree thesis must be taken. Enrolment in the master course is not mandatory: the choice is subject to the individual's interest in continuing their studies and deepening their training.

The **cultural heritage manager** is a professional figure with expertise in the enhancement of cultural heritage and the territory, working on planning and implementing cultural events and initiative. He/she possesses entrepreneurial skills and acts in accordance with the legislation on Cultural Heritage. It collaborates on the protection and enhancement of heritage with Superintendencies,

⁴ This section of the document has been drafted by Sara Fiorentino, University of Bologna.

Museums, public and private bodies that manage Museums, Archaeological Parks, Libraries and with firms operating in the cultural and tourism sector. The university training path is divided into a 3+2 program: in three years, a three-year bachelor degree in tourism sciences and a two-year master degree in economic sciences for culture. At the end of both the three-year and two-year periods, a degree thesis must be taken. Enrolment in the master course is not mandatory: the choice is subject to the individual's interest in continuing their studies and deepening their training.

The **conservator-restorer** (or restorer) of cultural heritage is the professional figure who evaluates and monitors the state of conservation and implements a set of direct and indirect actions to limit the processes of degradation of the constituent materials of the assets, to ensure their conservation and safeguard their cultural value. The academic training is described below in more details.

The **restorer of architectural heritage** is an architect whose training path has paid specific attention to structural restoration of historic buildings. The university training course provides for the achievement of a degree in architecture (five-year, single-cycle degree).

Which title/qualification do Italian restorers currently have? (i.e. BA, MA, PhD or other non-academic diplomas)

According to Legislative Decree 42/2004, Code of Cultural Heritage and Landscape⁵, and further modifications (Ministerial Decree 02.03.2011 - Establishment of the single-cycle master's degree program in Conservation and Restoration of Cultural Heritage - LMR / 02⁶), conservator-restorer must complete a single cycle degree in conservation and restoration of cultural heritage. Upon completion of the 5-years training course, candidates are required, parallel to the graduation exam, to pass a qualification test pursuant to D.L. 42/04 and D.M. 02.03.2011.

Do restorers have to provide any kind of certification to be professionally recognised?

For being professionally recognised as a conservator-restorer, it is necessary to be registered in an official list, available on the website of the Ministry for Cultural Heritage and Activities. Since the

⁵Full text: <https://www.gazzettaufficiale.it/dettaglio/codici/beniCulturali>

⁶ Full text: <https://www.gazzettaufficiale.it/eli/id/2011/06/17/11A07794/sg>

establishment of the single-cycle degree for conservator-restorer, all those who complete the qualifying course are directly enrolled in the lists of the Ministry, without taking further exams.

Which job opportunities do restorers have (i.e. can they only work in museums or in private companies as well)?

Qualified conservator-restorers can work/collaborate/participate in:

- Restoration laboratories and companies;
- Institutions of the Ministry of Cultural Heritage and Activities in charge of the protection of Cultural Heritage (Superintendencies, Museums, Libraries, Archives, etc.);
- Companies and professional organisations in the field;
- Public and private research institutions and bodies operating in the field of conservation and restoration of cultural heritage.

Is there any regulation or law defining the professional figure of the restorers, alongside their skills and competences?

Ministerial Decree no. 86, 26.05.2009⁷ states that the conservator-restorer of cultural heritage is a graduated professional figure who can evaluate the state of conservation of an artwork and to plan and carry out interventions to limit the degradation processes of the materials constituting cultural heritage, to guaranteeing its conservation and safeguarding its cultural value.

Is there any law or regulation identifying the certification bodies or Institutions in charge of verifying the acquired competences and skills?

In Italy, the Ministry of Cultural Heritage and Activities is the appointed Institution for verifying the acquired competences and skills.

⁷ Ministerial Decree May 26, 2009, n.86 e n. 87 (full text: <https://www.gazzettaufficiale.it/eli/id/2009/07/13/009G0098/sg>) provides: regulation on criteria and quality standards to which the accredited teaching courses for conservator-restorers are conformed, with the definition of the academic qualification issued following the passing of the final exam (pursuant to article 29, paragraphs 8 and 9, of Legislative Decree 42/2004, Code of Cultural Heritage and Landscape (*Codice dei Beni Culturali e del Paesaggio*, issued by the Ministry for Cultural Heritage and Activities); minimum organisational and operating requirements for teaching subjects and activities; accreditation procedures and the methods of supervising teaching activities; information on the structure of the final exam.

Is there any law or regulation specifying how to entrust a restoration job? (if yes, explain the required procedure)

Restoration works are assigned based on public tenders in which private companies in possession of specific requirements can participate. Tenders for public works and monuments of historical, artistic, archaeological and architectural interest are directly banned by public institutions (i.e. Municipalities and/or Regions). Conservation and restoration activities on artefacts of archaeological and historic-artistic interest preserved in museums are carried out by the personnel hired by public competition and dedicated to this purpose. Alternatively, works can be assigned to private companies registered in the lists of the Ministry of Culture in the specific sectors of competence by type of property.

Are there any training courses for restorers in Italy? (Indicate the Institutions/Universities where they are currently available as well)

Today, in Italy, there are 26 accredited Institutions for the training of conservator-restorers:

- N. 9 Fine Art Academies (Bologna, Milan, L'Aquila, Naples, Vibo Valentia, Como, Verona, Macerata, and Palermo)
- N. 10 Universities:
 - Torino: Centro Conservazione e Restauro La Venaria Reale (<https://www.centrorestaurovenaria.it/>)
 - Pavia: Università di Pavia (<http://mbc.unipv.it/index.php/didattica/offerta-formativa/restauro>)
 - Bologna: Alma Mater Studiorum Università di Bologna - Ravenna campus (<https://corsi.unibo.it/magistralecu/ConservazioneRestauroBeniculturali/index.html>)
 - Urbino: Università degli Studi di Urbino "Carlo Bo" (<https://restauro.uniurb.it/>)
 - Viterbo: Università degli Studi della Tuscia (<https://www.unitus.it/it/unitus/immatricolazioni-iscrizioni/articolo/test-di-ingresso-in-conservazione-e-restauro-dei-beni-culturali>)

- Roma: Università degli Studi di Roma "Tor Vergata" (https://web.uniroma2.it/module/name/Content/action/showpage/content_id/85313)
- Napoli: Università degli Studi "Suor Orsola Benincasa" (<https://www.unisob.na.it/ateneo/restauro/index.htm?vr=1>)
- Bari: Università degli Studi "Aldo Moro" (<http://www.restauro.uniba.it>)
- Palermo: Università degli Studi di Palermo (<https://www.unipa.it/dipartimenti/difc/cds/conservazionee рестауровеи beniculturali2187/>)
- N. 4 Ministerial Higher Education Schools (equated to Universities):
 - Roma: Istituto Superiore per la Conservazione e il Restauro (ISCR), Scuola di Alta Formazione e di Studio (<http://www.icr.beniculturali.it/>)
 - Roma: Istituto Centrale per la Patologia del Libro (ICPAL) (<http://www.saf-icpal.beniculturali.it/scuola/l-istituto/>)
 - Matera: Istituto Superiore per la Conservazione e il Restauro (ISCR), Scuola di Alta Formazione "Michele D'Elia" (<https://www.safmatera.iscr.beniculturali.it/>)
 - Firenze: Opificio delle Pietre Dure (OPD) (<http://opificiodellepietredure.it/>)
- N. 3 Third Parties (equated to universities):
 - Botticino: Scuola di Restauro ENAIP (<http://www.enaiplombardia.eu>)
 - Mantova: Istituti Santa Paola (<https://www.istitutisantapaola.com/>)
 - Roma: Istituto per l'Artigianato Artistico (<https://www.istitutorestauroroma.it/>)

Are there specific curricula and training paths within these courses? (i.e. specialised restores on archaeological materials/paintings/decorated architectural surfaces etc.)

According to D.M. 26/2009 n. 87, six professional training paths and curricula have been issued, grouping together different classes of cultural heritage materials (they are named PFP – *Percorsi Formativi Professionalizzanti* – see table below):

1. Stone materials and derivatives; decorated surfaces of architecture;

2. Artefacts painted on wooden and textile supports. Wood carved artefacts. Wooden furniture and structures. Manufactured in worked, assembled and/or painted synthetic materials.
3. Textile and leather materials and artefacts.
4. Ceramic, glass and organic materials. Materials and manufactured artefacts in metal and alloys.
5. Book and archival materials. Paper and parchment artefacts. Photographic, cinematographic and digital material.
6. Musical instruments. Scientific and technical instruments.

Textile, organic and leather materials and artifacts	PFP 3 Textile and leather materials and artefacts. PFP 4 Ceramic, glass and organic materials and artefacts. Materials and artifacts in metal and alloys
Ceramic and glass materials and artifacts	PFP 4 Ceramic, glass and organic materials and artefacts. Materials and artifacts in metal and alloys
Materials and artifacts in metal and alloys	PFP 4 Ceramic, glass and organic materials and artefacts. Materials and artifacts in metal and alloys
Book and archival material and paper and parchment artifacts	PFP 5 Book and archival material. Paper and parchment artifacts. Photographic, cinematographic and digital material
Photographic, cinematographic and digital material	PFP 5 Book and archival material. Paper and parchment artifacts. Photographic, cinematographic and digital material
Musical instruments	PFP 6 Musical instruments. Scientific and technical instruments and instruments
Scientific and technical instruments and instruments	PFP 6 Musical instruments. Scientific and technical instruments and instruments

How is the workload required by the study programs structured by year? (the amount of hours dedicated to both lectures and practical activities should be provided)

In line with D.M. 26/2009 n. 87, the training of cultural heritage conservator-restorers is split into 300 formative credits, corresponding to the training credits required by the current university teaching system (ECTS). Within the single-cycle degree program, the total amount of teaching hours is structured to ensure that a percentage between 50% and 65% of the overall activities, including the individual study and the thesis preparation, is reserved for technical-didactic activities of conservation and restoration carried out in the laboratory and on site, and the remaining part to theoretical-methodological subjects. Details on training objectives, teaching areas and disciplines, as well as the number of training credits, are identified in Annex C to this Decree⁸.

Moreover, the Decree specifies that the technical-didactic conservation and restoration activities have to take place in laboratories available at school yards, delivered by the training institution, under the teaching and professional responsibility of the course teachers. The number of students is established in relation to the available spaces available and must, in any case, guarantee a number of students per teacher not exceeding five.

Which type of qualification do these training courses on restoration issue?

According to the guidelines provided by E.C.C.O. and EnCORE, the 5-years training courses correspond to EQF level 7 in the European System.

How is the qualification awarded? (i.e. thesis dissertation, practical test, or other form of verification of the acquired skills)

The final exam is organised by the home institution delivering the training and it is divided into two tests: an applicative purpose one, consisting of a practical-laboratory intervention and a theoretical-methodological one, consisting in the dissertation of a written thesis. If the first test is not passed, the candidate can repeat the exam in the next session.

Which the minimum competences and skills verified at the end of a training course in restoration are?

How were these requirements outlined?

Graduates from the 5-years training courses must acquire:

⁸ Full text of Annex C is available at: <https://www.gazzettaufficiale.it/eli/id/2009/07/13/009G0098/sg>

- historical, scientific and technical bases necessary for the exercise of the profession of restorer of cultural heritage;
- solid practical preparation based on the necessary manual skills;
- a high level of professional, decision-making and operational autonomy in relation to the problems of conservation and restoration of cultural heritage;
- the ability to critically evaluate the data relating to the technique and state of conservation of cultural heritage materials and objects, interpreted in the light of historical and scientific knowledge to solve the problems related to prevention, maintenance and conservative intervention;
- the ability to intervene in emergency situations of cultural heritage by activating the appropriate actions in emergency situations;
- the ability to manage interventions and work staff also under legal and economic aspects;
- IT skills useful for managing the documentation relating to cultural heritage;
- the ability to collaborate with specific professional figures operating in the field and to communicate the results of the activity carried out;
- knowledge of the ethical principles and ethical reasons underlying the operational choices;
- awareness of the most updated international guidelines on restoration;
- written and oral command of at least one language of the European Union, in addition to Italian.

Which the responsible Institutions for verifying the acquired skills are?

As reported in the D.M. 26/2009 n. 87, the Final Exam Commission is composed of seven members, appointed by the directors of the training institutions, and includes: at least two members designated by the Ministry of Cultural Heritage and Activities among those inscribed in the register of restorers for at least five years; two university professors designated by the Ministry of Education, University and Research.

Assessment of the current scenario in Spain⁹

Which title/qualification do Spanish restorers currently have? (i.e. BA, MA, PhD or other non-academic diplomas)

In Spain, education system for restorers is based on a dual model, as the qualification can be provided by universities and also by specific "Schools of Conservation" (public institutions, very traditional and valuable in many Regions).

Before further specifications, it has to be stressed that, in Spain, currently most Bachelor Degrees are 4-year courses, while Masters are 1-year courses, so it is quite different from other European countries (4+1 instead 3+2).

There are four possibilities for the training of restorers:

- PhD, QF-EHEA 4 (very few conservator-restorers possess this title, which has been made only recently available by Universities).
- MA, QF-EHEA 3 (some conservator-restorers have this title, only recently available, mainly through universities but also through "Schools of Conservation").
- BA, QF-EHEA 2 (many conservator-restorers have this title; some of them graduated from Universities (old and new study programs), while others graduated from "Schools of Conservation" (new study programs)).
- "Diplomatura", QF-EHEA 1 (3-years training course, now extinct; this is the qualification that most conservator-restorers currently have, all of them linked to old study programs delivered by "Schools of Conservation").

In addition, different systems of specialisation are available, in BA and "Diplomatura".

Current academic titles nowadays are:

- (FROM SCHOOLS) Arts Bachelor Degree in Cultural Heritage Conservation and Restoration of Cultural Heritage (4 years, fully equivalent to University Bachelor Degree). Two first years are

⁹ This section of the document has been drafted based on collected data from need analysis, carried out by Fernando Carrera, Andrea Fernández and Álvaro Arizaga, Galician School for Heritage Conservation and Restoration.

common; two last years include compulsory specialisations (Sculpture, Paintings, Archaeology, Textiles, Documents, Furniture).

- (FROM UNIVERSITIES) University Bachelor Degree in Cultural Heritage Conservation and Restoration (4 years). Specialisations are not available.

Past academic titles, still active:

- (FROM SCHOOLS) Arts Degree in Cultural Heritage Conservation and Restoration (3 years; equivalent to University "Diplomatura"). First year common: two last years include compulsory specializations (Sculpture, Archaeology, Paintings, Documents).
- (FROM UNIVERSITIES) Arts Bachelor Degree in Fine Arts, with general specialization in conservation-restoration. 5 years. No specializations by materials or types of cultural heritage.

The shift from past academic titles to the new ones has started very recently (less than a decade ago). Last, Masters and PhD are both quite recent for conservation-restoration. Masters can be offered by Universities and Schools of Conservation. PhD can be offered by universities, or by Schools only in the case they are collaborating with universities.

Do restorers have to provide any kind of certification to be professionally recognised?

Restorers do not have to provide specific certification to be professionally recognised. Their academic titles give them professional competences, but, apart from that, there are not additional certifications needed (or even existent).

Which job opportunities do restorers have (i.e., can they only work in museums or in private companies as well)?

They can work freely in public or private institutions, being those museums, archives, libraries, educational institutions, heritage-related institutions, research centres... Regarding private enterprises, they are mostly small-scale companies and independent (freelance) workers (called "autonomous" in Spain). There is an important lack of really big companies specific for conservation-restoration (most of them are architectural, engineering or archaeological companies, with some conservator-restorers working for them; in many cases, big non-CR companies subcontracting CR-companies).

Is there any regulation or law defining the professional figure of the restorers, alongside their skills and competences?

In Spain, there currently is neither a regulation nor a law (at state or regional level) defining the professional figure of the restorers, their skills and competences. Some Associations claim that E.C.C.O. Professional Guidelines¹⁰ should be legally applied, but by now nothing like that appears in Spanish law¹¹.

Is there any law or regulation identifying the certification bodies or Institutions in charge of verifying the acquired competences and skills?

No

Is there any law or regulation specifying how to entrust a restoration job? (if yes, explain the required procedure)

Analogously, there is neither a law nor a regulation outlining criteria for the assignment of a restoration work. According to Heritage Law (entered into force in 1985), specific heritage laws are mostly ruled and applied by Regional Governments, with their own regulations. So, situations for professionals in CR may slightly vary from region to region, in terms of their relationship with the Administrations.

Are there any training courses for restorers in Spain? (Indicate the Institutions/Universities where they are currently available as well)

See answer to first question. Summarising:

- Schools of Conservation (6 examples): 240 ECTS / BA + 60 ECTS / MA
- Universities (7 examples): 240 ECTS / BA + 60 ECTS / MA

There are Schools of Conservation in Galicia, Asturias, Madrid, Barcelona, Castilla y León and Aragón (in no particular order).

¹⁰ See Paragraph 3 of this document for more details.

¹¹ The most important association is ACRE (*Asociación de Conservadores-Restauradores de España*). More details can be found at: <https://asociacion-acre.org/acciones/plan-para-la-regulacion-de-la-profesion/> ; <https://drive.google.com/file/d/18RG04fvH-DUiMTnPKW1puY7iXgUZLfD/view>.

There are Universities teaching conservation-restoration in Universidad Complutense (Madrid), Universidad Politécnica de Valencia, Universidad de Barcelona, Universidad de Granada, Universidad de Sevilla, Universidad del País Vasco and Universidad de La Laguna (Canarias) (in no particular order).

Are there specific curricula and training paths within these courses? (i.e. specialised restorers on archaeological materials/paintings/decorated architectural surfaces etc.)

See answer to first question. Summarising:

- Yes, in Schools of Conservation (BA, 4 years), during last two years. 6 specialisations:
 - Archaeological materials
 - Paintings
 - Sculpture
 - Documents
 - Furniture
 - Textiles
- Not in Universities (BA, 4 years). Depending on the study program, some subjects might be chosen, but the final title is the same for all students.
- Masters, from universities or from Schools, might imply some kind of specialization, but nowadays they are mostly general courses.

How is the workload required by the study programs structured by year? (the amount of hours dedicated to both lectures and practical activities should be provided)

More or less 50% are theoretical lessons and 50% practical lessons, both in Schools and in Universities.

Which type of qualification do these training courses on restoration issue?

See first answer. Currently, BA and MA.

How is the qualification awarded? (i.e., thesis dissertation, practical test, or other form of verification of the acquired skills)

In BA, it is compulsory to do a practical traineeship during last year; at least in some MA, if not all, the traineeship is also compulsory. There is also a thesis dissertation, both in BA and MA, always as a final required step.

Which the minimum competences and skills verified at the end of a training course in restoration are?

How were these requirements outlined?

For Schools of Conservation, there is a legal document by Spanish Ministry of Education with minimum competences and skills¹². Each regional government adapted this general framework to their regional studies, with no fundamental differences.

Regarding Universities, each University program is autonomous, provided they are able to pass quality controls and verifications.

In the end, all competences and skills appear in the student's European Diploma Supplement, both for Schools and for Universities.

Which the responsible Institutions for verifying the acquired skills are?

There are no institutions doing such a job, apart from normal verifications and monitoring by Quality Agencies, at a national or at a regional level.

All University titles, both BA and MA, passed by external agencies quality verifications (from, for instance, ANECA¹³).

In the case of Schools of Conservation, MA had to pass also external quality verifications, while BA were directly designed and approved by the Ministry of Education, first, and Regional Governments, second.

¹² <https://www.boe.es/buscar/doc.php?id=BOE-A-2010-8959>

¹³ <http://www.aneca.es/>

Professional recognition, education and qualification of conservator-restorers: summary on current key issues at EU level

The very first definition of conservator-restorer as a professional figure and their areas of intervention dates to 1984 (Meeting of the Standards and Training Committee of ICOM-CC, Copenhagen)¹⁴. From then, even though European Union has repeatedly highlighted the need to share intervention strategies and best practice approaches and methodologies at an international level¹⁵, this aim still has to be reached.

The heterogeneity of the conservator-restorer as a professional figure clearly emerged from the aforementioned document published in 1984, where their specific competences had been highlighted and the need for a close collaboration and cooperation with other professional figures, scholars and technicians operating in the field of Cultural Heritage had been emphasised (*"the conservator-restorer cannot be an expert in art or cultural history, chemistry, and/or other natural or human sciences"* and *"the conservator-restorer is able to formulate his questions scientifically and precisely, and to interpret the answers in the proper context"*). The document also provided some preliminary guiding-elements for the implementation of training courses devoted to these specific professionals (*"he must receive artistic, technical and scientific training based upon a well-rounded, general education"*, *"Training should involve the development of sensitivity and manual skill"*, *"A thesis or diploma paper should terminate training, and its completion recognised by the equivalent of a university graduate degree"*).

In 1991, E.C.C.O., **European Confederation of Conservator-Restorers' Organization**¹⁶, was established by 14 European Conservator-Restorers' Organisations intended to embrace the above considerations and defining the first international network of organizations and individuals operating in the field of conservation and restoration, sharing common principles and strategies. E.C.C.O. Currently representing close to 6.000 professionals within 22 countries and 25 members organisations, including one international body (IADA), E.C.C.O. embodies the field of preservation of cultural heritage, both movable and immovable. During its more than 25 years of existence, E.C.C.O. has established principles and fought for regulation to control access to the profession of the

¹⁴ <http://www.icom-cc.org/47/history-of-icom-cc/definition-of-profession-1984/>

¹⁵ Convention on the Value of Cultural Heritage for Society (Faro's Convention, 2005); Fostering cooperation in the European Union on skills, training and knowledge transfer in cultural heritage professions, work plan for culture 2015-2018; European Framework for Actions in Cultural Heritage.

¹⁶ <http://www.ecco-eu.org/>

conservator-restorer, by articulating professional standards and publishing guidelines for education and practice.

In 1997, signing the **Pavia Document**, the members of E.C.C.O underwent an even more specific definition path regarding the training of the conservator-restorer, aimed at providing guidelines at European level. Starting from 2002, a series of documents have been prepared and disseminated by E.C.C.O., all merged, in 2010, in a final document (approved by the Confederation Members during the General Assembly of Members of E.C.C.O.) which defines the competences of the conservator-restorer as "*the combination of knowledge and skills, joint to experiences, which allows the conservative-restorer professional to carry out the work in a coherent and responsible way*"¹⁷. The same document states that the entry-point to the profession cannot take place before reaching the Level 7 of the **EQF** system (**European Qualifications Framework**)¹⁸, corresponding to a two-year master's degree or a higher level of education.

Following the guidelines reported in the Pavia Document and the recommendations by E.C.C.O., **ENCoRE (European Network for Conservation-Restoration Education)**¹⁹ was established in 1997, with the aim of promoting education and research in the field of conservation-restoration of cultural heritage, and to foster the academic level of the education of the conservator-restorer, according to the Professional Guidelines of E.C.C.O.²⁰ and encouraged by the Pavia Document. ENCoRE's task is to bring together all the European institutions with study programs in the field of conservation and restoration, according to the principles promoted by E.C.C.O. To join the network, the Institutions must submit a request to the Examining Commission, which evaluates, through inspections, compliance with the guidelines proposed by E.C.C.O.

At its third General Assembly in 2001, ENCoRE delivered its contribution to the harmonisation of conservation-restoration education at university level or recognised equivalent though the document "Clarification of Conservation/Restoration Education at University Level or Recognised Equivalent"²¹. Taking into consideration the Bologna Declaration on the European Higher Education Area, the document states that the quality, democratic control of, and public insight into, conservation-restoration education can only be guaranteed by governmentally-validated academic education at

¹⁷ http://www.ecco-eu.org/fileadmin/assets/documents/publications/ECCO_Competences_EN.pdf

¹⁸ <https://ec.europa.eu/ploteus/en?cookie=no>

¹⁹ <http://www.entre-edu.org/>

²⁰ The ENCoRE Document of Constitution, Dresden, 9th November 1997, <http://www.entre-edu.org/ENCoREConstitution.html>

²¹ Clarification of Conservation/Restoration Education at University Level or Recognised Equivalent, ENCoRE 3rd General Assembly 19 - 22 June 2001, Munich, Germany <http://www.entre-edu.org/ENCoRE-documents/cp.pdf>

university level, leading to protected and internationally recognised academic titles. It also states that educational institutions which are not called universities, but which offer programmes of study which in length, content and quality are regarded by the governmental validating bodies to be equivalent to university degree provision, should be recognised as being at that same level. It declares that as an academic discipline the basis of education in conservation-restoration is based on a proper balance between integrated theoretical and practical teaching. Moreover, the document defines as an aim that the conservator-restorer licensed for independent practice is per definition a graduate at Master's level from a university or governmentally recognised equivalent, or doctoral research level (PhD), and that the overall length of study for entry into the profession or to continue to doctorate level should be five years.

However, the current situation mapped by ENCoRE shows a noticeable misbalance towards central-eastern Europe, where the largest number of organizations and institutions are joining the network, while many other consolidated realities at national level in the training of conservators-restorers are not even present. This probably occurs because adherence to ENCoRE takes place exclusively on a voluntary basis, by submitting an assessment request by the examining Commissioners; therefore, the mapping is not consistent with the actual distribution of Institutions providing training for conservators-restorers.

In December 2018, at the end of the **European Year for Cultural Heritage**, the European Council has commissioned a working group of experts to present to the Member States a **general framework** and an **action plan** in the field of **European Cultural Heritage and their professionals**. Results from this analysis have been published in the document "Fostering cooperation in the European Union on skills, training and knowledge transfer in Cultural Heritage professions"²², where the working group emphasised how to achieve the ultimate goal of an integrated and participatory approach to conservation and management of European Cultural Heritage. The key points identified in the document relate to:

- training and education of cultural professionals, which must be as transversal as possible, ranging from the creative industry to research institutes;
- sharing knowledge and skills, through digital methods, face-to-face practices, mentoring and apprenticeship;

²² <https://op.europa.eu/en/publication-detail/-/publication/e38e8bb3-867b-11e9-9f05-01aa75ed71a1/language-en/format-PDF/source-98656174>

- recognition at European level of skills and knowledge, to guarantee the practical quality of professionals, through community accreditation, certification, certification or registration criteria;
- developing opportunities for updating and increasing skills and knowledge;
- strengthening European standards in conservation and restoration of cultural heritage.

Moving from the above key points, the working group has identified strengths and weaknesses the European Council invites Member States to pay more attention to. A lack of qualitative indicators has been, for instance, highlighted in the field of training. The EQF system (**European Quality Framework**) was born as a representative model at European level of knowledge and skills that European citizens can achieve during their educational path. The system is divided into 8 levels, corresponding to a degree of national training paths. Although the EQF system has been established in 2008, there are not many higher education institutions that currently state their educational goals by adopting it, nor are there any official accreditation methods. The European institutions that issue the title of conservator-restorer are still wide-ranging, being distributed among Universities, Academies and Research Institutes.

Some Member States have started the process of defining the educational path for conservators-restorers, adopting the suggestions of E.C.C.O. for the condition of access to the profession, which can be reached only at EQF level 7 (two-year master's degree). However, the training offer currently available for future conservators-restorers is still fragmentary, entrusted to different bodies and institutions with mixed paths between Universities, Government Agencies or National Associations. It is, therefore, not uncommon to find courses for "conservator-restorer" corresponding to EQF level 6 (three-year degree) which, although contemplate in their paths some proposals from the E.C.C.O.'s Guidelines, do not qualify the participants as "*an autonomous and competent professional in the decision-making process on the cultural good*", basic condition for becoming a conservator-restorer. During their training, the conservator-restorer must be able to develop a high capacity in terms of holistic understanding of Cultural Heritage and decision-making, in order to guarantee the highest level of care and quality of intervention. Training must, therefore, be as transversal as possible, ranging from the humanities to scientific and digital disciplines, as well as guaranteeing adequate space for the practice, with simulations on real cases and the possibility of continuous updating.

Despite the programs activated by the European Union in support of actions related to Cultural Heritage, no European Agency exists today for the development of cross-cutting themes on Cultural

Heritage. This gap is often filled by non-governmental organizations, like E.C.C.O., ICCROM, ICOM and ICOMOS, which offer to their associates opportunities for exchange, tools, resources and lifelong learning programs.

A shared definition of "best practices" is missing from the European Union as well. For cultural professions, and specifically for the conservator-restorer, the sharing of skills and knowledge has been repeatedly highlighted, through practice supervised by experts, with appropriately extended apprenticeship and mentoring activities. The training still suffers from outdated models and, above all, a lack of trainers who have adequate pedagogical knowledge.

Since 2004, the CEN (European Committee for Standardization) works on the categorization of materials, processes, procedures, practices, methodologies and documents related to the conservation of tangible assets, thus supporting the creation of a common language. Since mid-2018, more than 30 EN (European Normalization) documents have been dismissed from CEN. However, they are currently available for payment only in English, French and German.

To conclude, although it is undeniable that considerable steps forward have been made with a view to a more precise definition of the education criteria and the requirements that the figure of the conservator-restorer must possess, a rather complex and heterogeneous scenario has been outlined. The main criticality can be identified in an overall scarcity of structural interventions, often left to each Member States, that have not yet adapted their models and their standards neither to the regulatory framework nor to the educational level.

Concluding remarks and considerations on future perspectives

The analysis of the context related to the professional recognition and education of conservator-restorers has highlighted the occurrence of three different situations in Albania, Italy and Spain, which are different from each other and can be summarised as follows:

- In Albania, the National Committee for the Material Cultural Heritage is the authority responsible for establishing the requirements that restorers must have and for issuing the license. To date, conservator-restorer as a professional figure still lacks a well-defined profile; therefore, skills and/or qualifications they have to possess can vary, depending upon the category for which the applicant is presenting his/her request (i.e. restorers of architectural pieces, or restorers of art works etc). The Ministry of Culture, through the Institutions under its authority, is the certification body for Albanian conservator-restorers operating in the field of cultural heritage. As the conservator-restorer is not a regulated profession yet, there currently is no state exam needed for exercising the profession. Their training is carried out under the Regional Centre for Conservation and Restoration, which deals with licensed persons too. In addition, according to decision of the Council of Ministers no. 792, of 07.10.2020 a Master of Science in Architecture, Archeology, Constructing Engineering and /or plus 1- year Professional Master in “Conservation and Restoration” is requested. The Faculty of Architecture and Urbanism at Polytechnic University Tirana is currently the unique institution providing this 1-year Professional Master Degree in Restoration. Candidate students wishing to pursue this title must have as minimum 3-years of studies in the Integrated Diploma of Architecture and Urbanism, or must have the Bachelor Degree in Civil Engineering.
- In Italy, Ministerial Decree 26.05.2009 n.87 defines the conservator-restorer of cultural heritage as a professionally recognised figure. In line with Legislative Decree 42/2004 and further modifications (Ministerial Decree 02.03.2011), conservator-restorers must complete a 5-years single cycle degree program in conservation and restoration of cultural heritage (according to D.M. 26/2009 n. 87, six professional training paths and curricula have been issued, grouping together different classes of cultural heritage materials). Upon completion of the course, candidates are required, parallel to the graduation exam, to pass a qualification test pursuant to D.L. 42/04 and D.M. 02.03.2011. Professionally recognised conservator-

restorers are registered in an official list, available on the website of the Ministry for Cultural Heritage and Activities. Candidates who have completed the 5-years education program are, after having passed both the graduation and the qualification exam, directly enrolled in the list of the Ministry. According to the guidelines provided by E.C.C.O. and EnCORE, the 5-years training courses correspond to EQF level 7 in the European System. In Spain, there currently is not a law defining the professional figure of conservator-restorers, alongside their skills and competences. Education system for conservator-restorers is based on a dual model, as the qualification can be provided by both Universities and "Schools of Conservation" (public institutions, very traditional and valuable in many Regions). Within Schools of Conservation (BA, 4 years), 6 specialising training paths are available (archaeological materials, paintings, sculpture, documents, furniture, textiles); at Universities (BA, 4 years), depending on the study program, some subjects might be chosen, but the final title is the same for all students. Masters can also be offered by Universities and Schools of Conservation. In BA, it is compulsory to do a practical traineeship during last year; at least in some MA, if not all, the traineeship is also compulsory. There is also a thesis dissertation, both in BA and MA, always as a final required step.

Restorers do not currently have to provide specific certification to be professionally recognised, apart from their academic diploma. There is neither a law nor a regulation in force specifying the certification bodies or Institutions in charge of verifying the acquired competences and skills. Analogously, criteria for the assignment of a restoration work are not legally specified. According to Heritage Law (entered into force in 1985), specific heritage laws are mostly ruled and applied by Regional Governments, with their own regulations.

Collected data with reference to Albania, Italy and Spain echo the outlined scenario pertaining to the professional recognition, education and training of the conservator-restorer on the international scene, with specific attention to the EU framework: heterogeneity of available training courses; different amounts of hours dedicated to the acquisition of theoretical skills and hands-on experience; diversity of diplomas issued by the institutions that deal with the training of restorers; different national legislations in force on the topic.

According to ENCoRE didactic requirements, the education process for conservator-restorers must prepare the trainee for the responsibilities that they will have to take on while exercising the

profession. Therefore, the trainees must practice on conservation-restoration projects during their education. It has, however, to be highlighted that in the education field the term “practice” is not always clear when comparing existing university curricula with the requirements of the profession. A sound definition of the term “practice” and its implications within the educational context of the conservator-restorer is essential to endow graduates from different universities or educational institutions with the necessary knowledge, skills and competences, according to the E.C.C.O. 2011 description²³.

Practice can be defined as *“the comprehensive activity of providing physical care for cultural heritage, being associated with its interpretation, and representing the core competence of the conservator-restorer. It is based on the understanding of the appearance, meaning, values, material composition, and condition of the cultural heritage object as interdependent parameters and their relevance to the decision-making process”*²⁴.

Based on the above definition, the learning outcomes of conservator-restorer education programmes must include all the necessary knowledge, skills and competences to allow the professionals to be to scientifically and methodologically act with reference to key activities and tasks that can be summarised as follows:

- strategic planning
- assessment of condition (state of conservation of heritage assets/collections)
- drawing up of conservation plans and treatment proposals
- preventive conservation
- conservation-restoration treatments and documentation of interventions
- development of projects and surveys in the field of conservation-restoration
- advice and technical assistance for the preservation of cultural heritage
- prepare technical reports on cultural heritage
- disseminate information gained from examination, treatment or research and, thus, promote a deeper understanding of the field of conservation-restoration

To prepare future conservator-restorers, with a profile and code of ethics according to the E.C.C.O. Professional Guidelines, the teaching of all aspects and activities of practice as shown in the EQF

²³ http://www.ecco-eu.org/fileadmin/assets/documents/publications/ECCO_Competences_EN.pdf

²⁴ <https://www.encore-edu.org/PracticePaper2014.html>

description by E.C.C.O. is necessary. The final aim of conservation-restoration education is to impart all the knowledge, skills and competences needed for access to the conservation-restoration profession, so that the graduate can undertake all the responsibilities linked to the preservation of the cultural heritage.

In conservation-restoration education, training activities should, therefore, include the following topics and fields of study:

1) Studies in materials, techniques and technology

To understand the materials constituting cultural heritage objects and the technology for producing them, to experience and learn about material behaviour and develop various dexterity skills related to the creation of the objects.

2) Diagnostic examination of the object and object collections

Identifying and documenting the conservative status of an object by investigation or analysis of the cause or nature of a condition and a statement or conclusion from such an analysis (it has to be specified that the selection of analyses to be carried out and the interpretation of the relative data is responsibility of the conservation scientist. However, the restorer must be trained in such a way as to be able to dialogue with this figure and agree on investigation protocols that can provide effective and suitable characterisation of the heritage object/asset to be restored and any related conservative issues).

3) Assessment

- Condition assessment covers the basic cognitive process of classification of an object or collections of objects into classes or categories with respect to condition and context.
- Risk assessment is the determination of quantitative or qualitative value of risk related to a concrete situation and a recognized threat.

4) Planning and decision making concerning non-interventive and interventive measures

5) Application of case-related non-interventive measures

Preventive conservation assessment, including long term conservation strategies, collection care, risk management and practice directly related to object/item(s) but without direct intervention

6) Application of case-related Interventive C-R measures

- Testing of materials and methods
- Interventive practice directly related to object/item(s) or their constituting materials (“hands on practice”)

7) Digital documentation

Preparation of any form of documentation relating to the composition, condition, alteration, previous interventions and current treatment of the cultural heritage object (also called “condition report”).

8) Experience of professional practice

Training under realistic working conditions, including “hands on” practice but also organisational matters, contact and communication with stakeholders etc.

9) Dissemination

The dissemination of information gathered by the aforementioned activities.

To prepare trainees to be professional conservator-restorers, all the activities listed above should be present in a recognised Higher Education institution curriculum, provided by Universities or recognised equivalent Institutions (corresponding to EQF level 6-8). The hands-on part must be considered as the last point in a long list of researching, decision making, planning, testing of materials etc.

As stated in the introductory section of this document, primary aim of REACH project is an improvement of research capacities of Albanian higher education institutions in conservation and restoration of cultural heritage. Being aware of critical key issues pertinent, at international level, to the education and training of professional figures capable of operating on cultural heritage is the first step to be taken for incepting a capacity building process.

A well-structured knowledge of the requisites that the conservator-restorer must possess to intervene on cultural heritage consciously, will allow to adequately address the research training in the field, for the trainers of tomorrow to be in possession of an interdisciplinary knowledge and methodology in approaching the numerous issues inherent to conservation interventions on cultural heritage.